

Gloper Conference 2018 The Future of Pentecostalism

Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam Februari 9 & 10, 2018

Abstract Book

<b>Parallel Session I</b>	<b>Future of Pentecostal Beliefs and Practices</b>
Friday February 9, 2018	
Time: 14.30-16.30 hr.	

**Panel 1**            **Healing and Deliverance**  
Time                14.30- 16.30hr.  
Location           Filmzaal 1E-24  
Chair                Annemarie Foppen

**1.1 The Embodied Performance of Deliverance Prayer in Christian Healing Ministry**

Peter Althouse PhD, Southeastern University  
Email: [pfalthouse@seu.edu](mailto:pfalthouse@seu.edu)

Christian Healing Ministries in Jacksonville, Florida is a charismatic organization that promotes and practices Christian healing. Although known for healing prayers, its worldview is more holistic and includes different kinds of prayers that address emotional, psychological, spiritual and bodily health. Deliverance prayer is of particular interest because it imagines a world of “spirit attachments” that are introduced to the body through multiple origins including trauma, inappropriate lifestyle, genealogical history, and intentional or incidental occult involvement. However, deliverance ministry is particularly difficult to give explanation to since its imagined world of spirits is dissimilar to naturalistic explanations of disease. The contention of this paper is that deliverance prayer is performative in which the participants symbolically interact with each other in ritual situations consenting to an imagined reality. Findings are based on participant observations and interviews and are placed in the context of symbolic interaction and performance.

**1.2 “It is not only about healing, but about being whole”. African/ Dutch religious leaders perspectives on health and well-being.**

Brenda Bartelink PhD, University of Groningen  
Mr. Samuel Ekpo, University of Groningen / CRC Bible College  
Email: [b.e.bartelink@rug.nl](mailto:b.e.bartelink@rug.nl)

In teachings about health and well-being in African/ Dutch Pentecostal churches the physical, mental and spiritual are closely intertwined. Healing not only includes biomedical treatment of a particular illness, but also particular techniques of the self such as prayer and fasting. Being whole has further social meanings. Challenges to family and marital stability, are often seen as destabilizing the family members and (church) community. Consequentially, the roles of religious leaders are often not confined to Sunday preaching, but include moral leadership, pastoral care and counselling. This paper will focus on how Pentecostal leaders from African backgrounds in the Netherlands understand their role and how it shapes their teachings and pastoral practice. It will explore how these Pentecostal teachings and practices are shaped in the context of a secular Dutch society, in which African/ Dutch Pentecostals find themselves in minority positions.

### **1.3 The Priest as Physician: Interrogating the Efficacy of Faith Healing Among the Tiv of Central Nigeria**

Gbasha Clifford Terhide, PhD student and AHP Fellow, University of Jos.

Email: cliffgbash@gmail.com

Despite advances made in the medical sciences, there is a rising trend of patronage of non-orthodox health care delivery services such as African Traditional Medicine (ATM) and faith healing among the Tiv of Central Nigeria. This study examines the continuing patronage of spiritual cure centers and services provided by the Catholic Charismatic Renewal Healing ministry among the Tiv. The study adopts participant-observation, focus group discussion, interviews and the survey methods of data gathering. A random sampling technique of participants of healing places is used to select 500 respondents. The purpose is to show how factors such as low access to hospitals, the poorly equipped nature of hospitals in Tiv-land or perception of ill health and healing are complicating factors which are increasingly changing the Priest role to a Physician. In my study of the Tiv in Nigeria I found these factors much at play.

---

**Panel 2 Pentecostal Public Theology has moved to panel 7**

---

### **Panel 3 Pentecostal Identities and Mainline Christianity**

Time: 14.30-16.30 hr.

Location: 1B-10

Chair: Michael Bergunder

### **3.1 From a Pentecostal Identity to an "Undesired" Identity**

Abiud Fonseca, PhD, SEMISUD South American Seminary, Ecuador.

Email: afonseca@semisud.edu.ec

Identity, according to Z. Baumann was a modern intention with the idea of generating security based on homogeneity. Contemporary Pentecostalism is the fastest growing Christian movement in population and in the diversity of its expressions.

The pursuit of a Pentecostal identity is an unreachable task. The Pentecostal ethos seems to manifest rather an undesirable identity. For J. Sepulveda, the Pentecostal principle is: "protest or rejection against the absolutization of any cultural culture of the gospel of Jesus Christ". W. Vondey argues that the ludic nature of the Pentecostal experience makes Pentecostalism an "instrument of renewal" of contemporary Christian theology and spirituality.

Contemporary Pentecostalism does not have an identity based on doctrinal configurations, practices or norms. Its characteristics are the dynamism, the renovation, the ludic, the experience. So the search for Pentecostal identity instead of answering the question "what are we?" Seems to impose an answer; for that reason in its bases, the identity becomes something undesirable.

### **3.2 The proliferation of religious groups in Cameroon: dichotomy between mainline and Pentecostal churches**

Helen Namondo Linonge-Fontebo, PhD, University of Buea, Cameroon

Email: namondolinonge@gmail.com

This article focuses on the trend of religions in Cameroon and describes the mainline churches and Pentecostal movements. The differences and similarities between these groups are examined with an attempt to establish if there is a possibility for ecumenism among these churches in the midst of conflicts. The paper concludes by establishing the rhetoric of the church in Cameroon; being economic growth, personal uplifting, accumulation of wealth, healing from illnesses, breakthrough, miracles, giving, receiving and spiritual penance to gain heaven as preached by the Pentecostal Churches in Cameroon on the one hand and that of peace, community development, salvation of the soul by the mainline churches. This paper highlights the fact that, religion is not homogenous rather it is heterogeneous hence the need for religious pluralism. Therefore, both the mainline and Pentecostal churches must embrace religious tolerance for love, peace and non-violence for Cameroon to be a safe place.

### **3.3 Why are you Praying to the God of Elijah Like the Prophets of Baal? Counter-Pentecostal Narratives of Seventh-day Adventists in Nigeria**

Chigemezi Nnadozie Wogu, Ph.D Student Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam

Email: chigemezi.nnadozie@gmail.com

Because of the wide spread of Pentecostalism and its influence, Seventh-day Adventists (SDAs) in Nigeria are developing counter narratives to this kind of religiosity. This demonstrates that Christianity in Africa is not entirely Pentecostalized. However, scholars make sweeping generalizations and avow that African Christianity has a propensity to Pentecostal religiosity. Foremost scholars like Ogbu Kalu have treated the Pentecostal story in Africa as mainly an African response to Christianity. Such generalization overlooks some mainline denominations and mission churches as well as other African Christianities. Although mainline or mission churches in Africa are becoming "Pentecostal", not every church/denomination key into the "Pentecostal" fervor and worldview. In fact, SDAs in Ilishan-Remo, Nigeria practice Christianity differently. Based on a longer term engagement with SDAs and by exploring data generated from a four-week ethnographic research, this paper seeks to demonstrate how SDAs in Nigeria counter and confront Pentecostal influences in their ecclesial praxis.

### **3.4 The 1907 The Pyung-yang Revival as a Hidden Pentecostal Movement and its Implication to the Modern Pentecostal Movement in Korea**

Daniel S. H. Ahn, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam

Email: danielahn7@gmail.com

In 1907, a great revival (known as the Pyung-yang revival) emerged at *Jang-Dae-Hyun* Presbyterian Church in Pyongyang, founded by the Presbyterian missionaries from the US (PCUSA), and from here quickly spread out eventually covering the whole of the Korean Peninsula with the result of the remarkable growth of the early Korean Protestant Church. The PCUSA missionaries depicted its distinctive phenomenon among Koreans, such as, their loud prayers, public confession of sins, and reconciliation with neighbors. However, they left very few references to 'speaking in tongues' which can be the initial evidence for baptism in the Holy Spirit of the Pentecostal movement.

This paper will argue that the Pyungyang revival actually did feature 'speaking in tongues' and that the PCUSA missionaries intentionally omitted this from their records because of their Calvinistic Reformed theology which caused them to oppose the glossolalia of the Pentecostals. This paper will show how the modern Pentecostal movement is intentionally being neglected in the midst of the Reformed context in Korea.

#### **Panel Session 4            Pentecostal Theology, Discernment and Modernity**

Time            14.30-16.30 hr.  
Location        1B-06  
Chair            Sander Klaasse

##### **4.1      Orality and Pentecostal theology: a Heritage of Walter Hollenweger for the Development of the Pentecostal Theology in Latin America?**

Guillermo Moreno , PhD candidate, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam  
Email: memito257@hotmail.com

Walter Hollenweger has played a very important role in the development of Pentecostal theological thought. His influence in Latin America has been no exception. One of the intrinsic elements in Hollenweger's influence is the orality. Is there an influence of Hollenweger's orality in the development of the thought of Latin American Pentecostal theology?

Methodologically I would like to answer this question by following procedure: in first place, by making an analytical approach to orality in Walter Hollenweger. Second, I will take an example of the representative debate in the development of the Pentecostal theology: Steven Land and Frank Macchia and their relationship with the orality. In third place, by analyzing the influence of this debate in North and Latin America in relationship with orality. And finally, by analyzing theoretically what is the possible critical contribution of orality to the development of Pentecostal theological thought in Latin America.

##### **4.2      Criteria for Discernment for the Presence of the Holy Spirit in Other Religions**

Benno van den Toren PhD, PThU Groningen  
Email: [b.vanden.toren@pthu.nl](mailto:b.vanden.toren@pthu.nl)

One of the developments visible amongst a new generation of Pentecostal thinkers and practitioners is a growing openness for the presence of the Holy Spirit in other religions, exemplified in the work of Amos Yong. This development stands in tension with widespread in the worldwide Pentecostalism that see other religions as evil, often even as diabolic. I have written about the relationship between the Christological and Pneumatological viewpoint in the theology of religions before (Toren, Benno van den. « The Relationship between Christ and the Spirit in a Christian Theology of Religions ». *Missiology* 40/3 (July 2012): 263-80) and I would like to continue these reflections by asking "What are the criteria for the discernment of the presence of the Spirit outside the boundaries of the church?" Different criteria have been proposed that have biblical roots (such as the confession of the name of Jesus, the healing presence and the fruits of the Spirit, liberation). The question needs to be asked how such criteria relate to each other, but also more fundamentally what it means when we ask for criteria. Amos Yong will be one of the main conversation partners.

##### **4.3      Pentecostals from Francophone Africa on Science and Faith**

Klaas Bom PhD, PThU Groningen  
Email: [k.l.bom@pthu.nl](mailto:k.l.bom@pthu.nl)

Last three years I studied the discourses of Christian MA students and academics (mostly university professors) from Abidjan, Yaoundé and Kinshasa on science and faith. Both students and academics had diverse disciplinary and denominational backgrounds. The research was carried out with the help of Group Model building, a participatory research tool. Although a minority of the population was Pentecostal, in each of the six research groups there was Pentecostal participation. In this paper I analyse the contributions of these Pentecostals and ask if they present a specific and coherent understanding of science and faith, also in comparison to the other participants (mainly protestant-

evangelical and some Roman-Catholics). This will offer new insights in African Pentecostalism and in the Pentecostal understanding of science.

#### **4.4 A Re-appraisal of the Prosperity Gospel in African Neo-Pentecostalism: The Potency of “Multiple Modernities” Paradigm**

James Kwateng-Yeboah PhD Candidate in Cultural Studies, Queen’s University, Canada.  
Email: [jikk@queensu.ca](mailto:jikk@queensu.ca)

The role of African Neo-Pentecostalism in effecting modernity through its widespread “prosperity gospel” remains inconclusive. Scholars have persistently invoked Weber’s Protestant Ethic; yet findings reveal the prosperity gospel in Africa challenges dominant conceptualizations of modernity. On one hand, the phenomenon inspires entrepreneurship and individual autonomy. On the other hand, so-called “enchanted” forms of prosperity refute Weber’s central claim of modernity. Does the prosperity gospel demonstrate distinctively modern and anti-modern (or anti-western) themes? Drawing insights from the Akan cultural concepts of *well-being*, *dualistic view of life*, and *the role of religious functionaries*, this essay develops a sustained critique of the classical Eurocentric and unilinear view of modernity used in assessing the prosperity gospel. Showing that modernity is mediated by historical and cultural backgrounds of the society it encounters; the essay argues for the potency of the “multiple modernities” paradigm as a better analytical framework for the prosperity gospel in Africa.

#### **4.5 The Liminal Spirit: Ritual Experience in Luke’s Presentation of the Early Christian Sect**

David J. McCollough, PhD, Durham University  
Email: [david.j.mccollough@durham.ac.uk](mailto:david.j.mccollough@durham.ac.uk)

This paper first employs literary, narratological and discourse analysis approaches to evaluate the Spirit reception scenes in Luke-Acts. It then interprets the data in terms of anthropology/sociology of religion.

The analysis shows that, contrary to current opinion, Luke specifies a coherent, internally consistent model of ritual initiation into his sect. He allows for limited, minor variation within his standard structure. Belief in the kerygma, repentance, immersion in water, prayer by the initiate, prayer with handlaying by particularly powerful ritual elders, and climactically, dissociative tongues speaking that is consistent with the traditional tongues speaking practices of the sect, form the Lukan ritual process. The foregoing data indicate that initiation in the early Christian sect was liminal and involved a spirit-possession event evoking intense *communitas*.

<b>Parallel Sessions II</b>	<b>Future of Pentecostal Identities</b>
Saturday	February 10, 2018
Time:	9.00-11.00 hr.

#### **Panel Session 5 Negotiating Evangelical\* and Pentecostal\*: Global Entanglement, Local Identity Politics and the Future of Pentecostal Studies**

Time 9.00-11.00 hr.  
Location Filmzaal 1E-24  
Chair: Giovanni Maltese (Heidelberg), Co Chair: Katja Rakow (Utrecht)  
Respondent: Esther Berg, Graduate School for Philosophy and Theology Sankt Georgen, Frankfurt a.M.

### **5.1 The Better “Born-again”: Identity Politics between Evangelicals and Pentecostals in Nigeria**

Judith Bachmann, University of Heidelberg

Email: judith.bachmann@yahoo.de

“Evangelical” has recently been problematized with regard to African Christianity. In Southwest Nigeria, it is not a name Christians use as self-description – most of them prefer “born-again”, a name often identified with the Pentecostal movement in the country. Yet, “Pentecostal” is oftentimes used as a foil by groups who want to distinguish their own Christian identity. Looking at one of the few deviations from this practice, the paper compares a Southwestern Nigerian group which uses “Evangelical” as self-identification with an independent Pentecostal ministry and discusses how global discourses are strategically appropriated by minorities in the Nigerian context. Both groups perceive themselves as the “truly born-again alternative” focused on evangelism and a “Christian” lifestyle against “noisy and superficial” Pentecostal megachurches. Thus, the local actors attempt to relate to different international and national Christian networks in order to establish their own group as socially relevant.

Recent scholarship draws the distinctions between Pentecostal\* and Evangelical\* based on methodologically nontransparent criteria. Accordingly, the question on which grounds ethnographic studies from different continents relate to each other and to the discipline of Pentecostal Studies in general remains either unanswered or is addressed with a rather vague theory of family resemblances. This panel shows how a global history-framework which studies the appropriation of global discourses about Evangelical\* and Pentecostal\* vis-à-vis concrete local hegemonies can offer an alternative. Based on ethnographic data from field-research in Africa, Asia and Latin America the panel will discuss how local actors draw from different, yet entangled debates, in order to stage themselves as relevant players in their specific contexts.

### **5.2 Salvation Army and the Pentecostal challenge. Negotiating Caste, Church and Spirituality in India**

Johanna Weirich, University of Heidelberg

The Salvation Army has been active in the southernmost regions of India for more than a hundred years. Traditionally it enjoys great influence among the lowest castes, also known as Dalits. Recently however, members as well as outsiders speak of a crisis of the Salvation Army. Simultaneously, the growing Pentecostal churches, described as cross-caste, attract large constituencies from the missionary established churches. The Pentecostal challenge is omnipresent when the crisis is discussed, yet the conclusions drawn from this are various – ranging from clear damnation to extensive adoption of Pentecostal practices. Looking at a lay reform movement within the denomination, this paper discusses strategies of differentiation from or alignment with Pentecostals and shows how, thereby, identities – especially regarding church, caste and spirituality – are negotiated. Of special interest will be the question, how local debates are influenced by and entangled with global discourses on Pentecostalism and Evangelicalism.

### **5.3 Evangelical and Pentecostal in Israel: Local politics and global relevance**

Anna Maria Kirchner, University of Heidelberg

In Israel, „Evangelical“ serves as a name that unites churches with different historical roots and theologies: Baptists, Assemblies of God, Church of the Nazarene and Brethren Assemblies. By founding the Convention of Evangelical Churches, these churches seek official recognition as

religious community by the Israeli government. Hereby, they also hope to overcome their rather conflictive relationship with other churches (Orthodox, Catholics) and be recognized as equals. As “Evangelicals”, they are also able to enter into global evangelical networks and thus win strong international partners. Interestingly, while a charismatization can be seen in almost all the “Evangelical” churches in Israel, the name „Pentecostal“ is rejected as a self-identifier. Rather, “Evangelicals” exclude those within their circles who promote strong charismatic actions as “Pentecostals”, in order not to endanger their fragile position within the broader Christian community in Israel. The paper will thus interpret “Evangelical” and “Pentecostal” as global discourses strategically appropriated within local power relations.

#### **5.4 Entanglements and Boundaries between Evangelical and Catholic Charismatics in Costa Rica**

Nora Kurzewitz, University of Heidelberg

In Costa Rica, a large part of churches typically classified as Pentecostals in reference works, refer to themselves as “Evangelical” or as “Christian”. In doing so, they not only distinguish themselves from Catholics, whom they pejoratively call “religious”. They also negate their own entangled history with local Catholic Charismatics. This attitude can be traced back to (church-)political interventions in 1975. That year, the Catholic Church integrated large parts of the Charismatic movement, which then consisted of both, Catholics and non-Catholics. Thus, the Catholic Church claimed the potentially threatening movement as genuinely Catholic. This reinforced disavowals between Catholics and non-Catholics. It also pushed the non-Catholic churches to focus on commonalities instead of differences in order to position themselves against the Catholic dominance. In this anti-Catholic process of identity making, the name “Pentecostal” represented a hindrance. The paper will disentangle this complex name politics, by analyzing the interactions between local and global discourses, as well as the specific interests implied in the various identity making processes.

#### **5.5 Evangelicals and Pentecostals Philippines: Global Politics and Local Hegemony**

Giovanni Maltese, University of Heidelberg

Email: [giovanni.maltese@wts.uni-heidelberg.de](mailto:giovanni.maltese@wts.uni-heidelberg.de)

In 1982 the World Christian Encyclopedia listed only a few “Catholic Pentecostals”, while several Pentecostal churches, ran under the rubric “Evangelical”. The second edition (2001) however, listed “Pentecostal/charismatics” as a “trans-megablock”, comprising 26% of the country’s total population. Yet on the ground, nobody wants to be tagged “Pentecostal”. I argue that this should be understood as a political gesture. In the postcolonial Philippine context “Pentecostal” stands for hysteric low-class spirituality, close to fanaticism or for old-fashioned denominationalism resulting from a “colonial mindset” which still looks up to the US. “Charismatic” in turn is a name reserved for the Catholic renewal movement, which is the largest in the country. While “Evangelical” seems more feasible and serves to stage one’s own group as a relevant counterhegemonic force against dominant “Catholicism”, there are Catholic renewalists, who identify as “Evangelical”, too (“Catholic Evangelicals”). Drawing from ethnographic data, this paper studies different strategies of identity making by analyzing local hegemonic practices and their entanglement with global discourses on (church-)politics.

**Panel 6            Emerging Pentecostal Identities**

Time                9.00-11.00 hr.

Location           1E-30

Chair               Jorg Haustein

**6.1     Pushing Towards the Respectable: Mainstreaming of a Counter Cultural Religious Movement in Contemporary Chile.**

Martin Lindhardt PhD. University of Southern Denmark

Email: [lind@sam.sdu.dk](mailto:lind@sam.sdu.dk)

Within recent decades Chilean Pentecostalism has undergone significant shifts as it adapts to transformations in generational identities, class dynamics and a boom in higher education. Pentecostalism used to be the stigmatized religion of the marginal sectors of Chilean society and has often been interpreted by scholars in terms of counter-culture and symbolic protest. However, a new generation of Pentecostals is now attempting to redefine Pentecostalism as a more legitimate and respectable religion. This process involves attempts at gaining more political and public recognition and it involves redefinitions of Pentecostal stylistic and religious practices. Many younger Pentecostals opt towards new churches that place more emphasis on thorough bible study than traditional Pentecostal churches. Younger Pentecostals also tend to distance themselves, both from the “emocionalismo” (emotionalism) and what they perceive as the rigid formalism of classical Pentecostalism. The paper will explore how processes of mainstreaming and of pushing towards respectability unfold at various levels and cause occasional tensions within Pentecostal communities.

**6.2     Faces of Brazilian Contemporary Pentecostalism: a Socio-Religious Analysis of the New Pentecostal movements in Brazil**

Victor Breno Farias Barrozo, PhD candidate, Federal University of Paraiba, Brazil

Email: [victorbrenofb@gmail.com](mailto:victorbrenofb@gmail.com)

In the last 40 years, Brazilian Pentecostalism has undergone a process of diversification and complexification resulting from a triple movement in the national religious field: decomposition, composition and recomposition. These movements give rise to new forms of Pentecostal sociability and according to the IBGE statistical census of 2010, it points out that 20.7%, around 5 267 029 million people, of the Brazilian Pentecostal field is already formed by new groups independent of the great denominations the classical structures and the construction of communities stratified around groups of segments: like the Pentecostal churches directed to the LGBT public. From the dialogue with the authors of the sociology of religious modernity, it is to seek a socio-religious analysis of the new expressions of emerging Pentecostalisms.

Keywords: Pentecostalism in Brazil, Religious Modernity, New Pentecostal Movements.

**6.3     Inside into the Pentecostal Movement and its future in the English-speaking Caribbean**

Peter Marina PhD, University of Wisconsin-La Crosse

Email: [pmarina@uwlax.edu](mailto:pmarina@uwlax.edu)

This paper is based on extensive ethnographic work in the English-Speaking Caribbean and examines the Pentecostal movement in an understudied region of the world. The focus centers on various transnational religious networking strategies of charismatic leaders and its ability to influence the region, the blending of religion and culture in the Caribbean, the tensions between charisma and institutionalization, the challenges of church growth and power, the dialectical process of external adversity and internal conflict in the charismatic movement, and the simultaneous process of

structural centralization and decentralization as the church continues to grow in numbers and power. The focus on each of these issues has deep implications for the Pentecostal movement in the Caribbean and its ability to impart social change. This paper concludes with an outlook of the Pentecostal movement in the English-speaking Caribbean and its possibilities as it pushes towards the future.

#### **6.4 War against corruption: the dispositions of African Pentecostal leaders in Nigeria**

Akindolie Akinwumi Ambrose PhD student, University of Ibadan

Email: [akinwumi.akindolie@rcbc.edu.ng](mailto:akinwumi.akindolie@rcbc.edu.ng)

Corruption is a malady that is said to have eaten deep the fabric of the socio-economic and political development in Nigeria. Although, recent decade have witnessed a global public awareness and an increase in attempt to eradicate corruption, it is an ongoing problem. Many scholarly works have focused on different methods to tame the tide of corruption, however, much attention has not been given to the dispositions of African Pentecostal Leaders in warring against corruption; this is the vacuum this paper intends to fill. This study looks into corruption as a phenomenon, overview of some literatures in the campaign of war against corruption, African Pentecostal leaders and their dispositions in campaign against corruption with relevant recommendations.

Keywords: Corruption, Religious Leaders, Dispositions and Nigeria

---

#### **Panel 7 Pentecostal Public Theology and Conversion**

Time 9.00-11.00 hr.

Location 1B-06

Chair Andreas Heuser

#### **7.1 Afro-Pentecostal Churches and the Struggle for Constitutional Reforms in Kenya (2003-2010): A Retrospective-historical Analysis**

Stephen Kapinde, PhD student, Centre for African Studies, University of Basel.

Email: [asolstephen@yahoo.com](mailto:asolstephen@yahoo.com)

Until 2005, the Pentecostal Right Wing Evangelical Church clerics avoided direct political engagement with the State, apart from few occasions when they supported President Daniel Torotich Arap Moi's regime (1978-2002). Their political acquiescent was due to their theological interpretation of Romans 13:1-7 that calls for obedience to those in authority. President Moi appropriating this theological understanding of power, co-opted the leaders of major protestant Pentecostal Churches with promises of freedom of worship-open crusades and stipends to friendly Church leaders. However, this Pentocratic model of Church-State engagement changed significantly in Post-Moi era. As some of the mainline mission established Protestant Churches such as Anglican and Presbyterian clergy became closer to the NARC regime of President Emilio Mwai Kibaki (2003-2013), the Pentecostal Church clerics political philosophy became profoundly ambivalent. This paper while examining their contribution in the constitution making process will argue that this paradox is due to differences in terms of organization, social, theological and/or political interests. This is more evident in the struggle for Constitutional reforms in the Kenya where 'multiple brands' of Pentecostalism re-emerged.

Key: Afro-Pentecostalism, Politics, Emilio Mwai Kibaki, identity, power, public space

## **7.2 Toward a Peaceful and Just Future: an Ethnographic Study of Pentecostals Engaged in High Risk Social Action**

Paul Alexander, Ph.D. Research Fellow, University of Birmingham  
Email: paul.n.alexander@gmail.com

What motivates and sustains some pentecostals to risk their lives for peace, justice, and the wellbeing of others? I will present findings related to this and other questions emerging from a study made possible through a grant from the Templeton Foundation's Flame of Love Project for "Risking Death for the Love of God: A Theological and Psychological Study of Pentecostals Engaged in High Risk Social Action." In this qualitative and quantitative ethnographic study, a colleague and I learned from exemplars in Palestine, Israel, Guatemala, Colombia, and the USA. We operationalized "high risk" as working in a context under military duress, or where physical violence, life-threatening disease, or imprisonment was likely to occur. We used a grounded theory approach and complemented our data collection strategy (interviews and participant observation, such as walking in nonviolent direct actions) with ethnographic observations, field notes, self-report, story, filming, and photography.

## **7.3 The Role of Time in Social Scientific and Theological Treatments of Pentecostal Conversion Narratives**

Naomi Richman, University of Oxford  
Email: naomi.richman@theology.ox.ac.uk

This paper explores how understandings of time are conceived differently by social scientists and theologians, and how this serves to create a seeming disconnect or incompatibility between these two methodological approaches when it comes to theorising narratives of Pentecostal conversion, in particular. Drawing on recent conversations within the anthropology of Christianity, this paper advocates the use of a theologically-engaged anthropological method in order to make sense of how notions of time, and in particular the future, undergo transformation through the process of conversion to Pentecostalism, from mundane to eschatological. The paper puts forward a case for brokering a fresh inter-disciplinary relationship in the study of Pentecostal conversion, by arguing that theological and social scientific approaches are not just complementary, but interdependent as they both seek to theorise the underlying philosophical nature of time as past, present and future.

## **7.4 Conversion and the Real: The (Im)Possibility of Testimonial Representation**

Srdjan Sremac PhD, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam  
E-mail: s.sremac@vu.nl

Although the spiritual vibration of conversion can be felt (by the curious outsider) through what conversion performers say in their testimonial discourse, what transforms the convert 'on stage' into a 'new being' and what is 'the real' (*le réel*) in conversion performance remain unclear. An important question in this connection is, What is 'real' in a conversion representation, both with respect to the convert's interaction with the audience and to the construction of social reality? Following Lacan's tripartite register of the imaginary, the symbolic, and the real, in this essay I argue that through testimonial discourse converts construct social reality as an answer to the impossibility of 'the real' in their performative discursive practice. In the first part, I question the constructed nature of testimonial representations—as well as some academic knowledge production that has governed conversion research in the last few decades—and how these representations encourage 'outsiders' to read the narrative repertoire as a negation or mirroring 'the real' of the conversion experience. In the second part, I apply Roland Barthes' analytic reflections on photography to conversion research,

especially the notions of the *studium* (the common ground of cultural meanings) and the *punctum* (a personal experience that inspires private meaning). This brings me to a number of theorists (mostly never used in the field of religious conversion)—Jacques Lacan, Roland Barthes, and Slavoj Žižek—who are important to the perspective that is developed in this essay.

---

## **Panel Session 8            Pentecostal Transformations**

Time            9.00-11.00 hr.  
Location        1B-06  
Chair            Wolfgang Vondey

### **8.1      Worship Liturgies, Noise Nuisance and the Dilemma of African Pentecostalism in Belgium**

Joseph Bosco Bangura, Postdoctoral Fellow, North-West University, South Africa  
Email: [jbbangura@gmail.com](mailto:jbbangura@gmail.com)

While the growth of Pentecostalism in Roman Catholic Belgium has been attributed to the recent spike in migration, little scholarly research has been made to study the specificity and theological mutations of the worship liturgies of African migrant Pentecostal churches, who continue to be a major expression of minority religions in that country. Rather than ascribing value-based judgments about the worship liturgies of African Pentecostal migrant churches this paper argues that such theological exigencies must be interpreted in the context of the experience-based and functional nature of the African religiosity they symbolize. Given that church theological praxis is often the product of one's cultural habituation, the exuberant worship liturgies of African migrant churches have to be seen as an expression of the experiential nature of Pentecostalism. This paper discusses the intricacies of negotiating between noise nuisance and the African cultural desideratum embodied by Pentecostal worship liturgies in Belgium.

### **8.2      Changes in Beliefs and Practices Among Korean Pentecostals in Canada, 1997-2017**

Michael Wilkinson PhD, Trinity Western University  
Email: [Michael.Wilkinson@twu.ca](mailto:Michael.Wilkinson@twu.ca)

This presentation examines changes in beliefs and practices in a Korean congregation. Research findings are based on observations, interviews, focus groups, and a congregational survey. Data was collected in 1997, 2007, and 2017 and included questions about religious beliefs and practices, ethnic identity, social issues, and organizational relations. The findings are discussed in relation to sociological assumptions about the culture of congregations. The congregation is affiliated with the Pentecostal Assemblies of Canada and was started in the 1990s by Jacob Joo, a convert from Buddhism to Christianity that has grown from 100 to 400 members under his leadership. A portion of the findings will be discussed that focus on questions about beliefs and practices including healing, tongues, worship, spiritual gifts, and the role of the Holy Spirit, with implications for the future of Korean Pentecostalism in Canada.

### **8.3      The role of social media in migrants' Christianity: A case study of Nigerian Pentecostal churches in Switzerland**

Oderinde Peter Ayoola PhD candidate, University of Basel  
Email: [peterayoola.oderinde@unibas.ch](mailto:peterayoola.oderinde@unibas.ch)

As a major tradition within the global movement, the Pentecostal/Charismatic movement is a popular strand among migrant Christianity in Switzerland. This paper shows that the Pentecostal Christianity is moving towards the practice of online religion. It presents a major shift from scholarly research on real (offline) African Pentecostal churches to virtual (online) churches and other non-denominational charismatic communities. This pioneering research engages with the popularity of the social web/internet in African Pentecostal churches in their effort to shape their future direction in a European context. In order to provide an understanding of how migrant Christianity (GVI, BLW and OFM) is lived in Switzerland, the paper seeks to show how social media tools such as WhatsApp, Yookos, Twitter, Facebook and other livestream are turned into spiritual spaces.

#### **8.4 Constructing a Filipino Pentecostal Liberation Theology/ies**

Hadje Cresencio Sadjé, PhD candidate Vrije Universiteit

Email: hadjesadje@gmail.com

Religion plays a highly significant role in shaping Filipinos' lives and worldviews. It is clear that the need for a socially relevant Filipino theology/ies becomes more urgent as we Filipinos search for a truly Filipino faith-based understanding of Philippine political, psychological, and cultural/religious problems. Apparently, Filipino liberation theologians, however, have been preoccupied with social and political changes, while Pentecostal/Charismatic movements have been focused on ethnographic concerns (personal healing, personal debt, and deliverance from evil spirit), numerical growth, and church planting in Southeast Asian region. This sharp distinction will evaluate and critique in the light of relevant articles from Filipino theologians (Joseph Suico, David Lim, Karl Gaspar, Daniel Franklin Pilario), Wonsuk Ma, and the Ecumenical Association of Third World Theologians (EATWOT) writings. In doing so, the researcher, eventually, will attempt to construct a Filipino Pentecostal Liberation theology/ies beyond Filipino liberation and Pentecostal theologies.

### **III Future of Pentecostal Authority, Gender and Megachurches**

Saturday February 10, 2018

Time: 11.30-13.00 hr.

#### **Panel Session 9 Failed Prosperity Gospel has been cancelled**

#### **Panel Session 10 Pentecostal Authority and Gender**

Time 11.30-13.00 hr.

Location 1E-30

Chair: Allen Anderson

#### **10.1 "I am a "Man of God": Pentecostalism and Pastoral Entitlement in Sub-Saharan Africa**

Michael Perry N.O. Tettey PhD, Central University Ghana

Email: niiosah@yahoo.com

Pentecostalism in its different strands has been considered a significant religious phenomenon in terms of Christian growth and spread especially in the majority world. This phenomenal religious movement invariably has developed an idea of divine entitlement around the concept that could be termed "Man of Godism". This paper proposes that the role of the pastor as the head of the church in Pentecostalism portrays him/her as a symbol of divine power and authority. It again argues that pastoral work especially in sub-Saharan Africa assumes more that delivery a homily and performing other regular religious activities. It is all encompassing, touching on vast areas of community and

individual lives which is a 'dynamic equivalence' of what traditional religious practitioners were noted for. In view of the above propositions, I argue that Pentecostal pastoral leadership in Ghana for example, is seen in the light of the African traditional religious reflection of 'a person of God.' Again, I conclude that Pentecostal-charismatic pastors operate with the mind-set as agents of God's divine authority.

### **10.2 Gender Ideology in 21<sup>st</sup> Century Pentecostalism: a New Testament Perspective**

Caroline Dimingu, PhD candidate University of South Africa (UNISA)

Henerieta Mgovo, PhD candidate University of Botswana

Email: carolinedimingu@yahoo.com

This research is a New Testament Feminist enquiry into the interface between leadership of couples in Pentecostalism and gender relations. The research argues that gender ideology in Pentecostalism suggest both liberated and restricted roles for women, where women are allowed to lead only as adjuncts of men. The research adopted a qualitative approach and a case study research design. In-depth face to face interviews were conducted to come up with the findings of this research. The research finds out that the issue of leadership couples was there from New Testament times and the phenomenon has been revived in the 21st century Pentecostalism and has greatly impacted on gender relations in the church today.

Keywords: Gender ideology, Gender relations, Leadership couples, Pentecostalism.

### **10.3 Dissident Pentecostals and the concept of "homosexual dictatorship" in Chilean public sphere**

Luis Aránguiz Kahn, Catholic University of Chile

Email: lrarangu@uc.cl

Pentecostals in Chile have been known as a diverse and mainly conservative religious group. After the dictatorship of Pinochet and taking advantage of the new democratic scene, they have adopted different ways to manifest its positions. In spite of their internal differences, it is possible to say that, in different levels, their reaction has been mainly opposite to the progressive agenda fostered by leftwing president Michelle Bachelet (2014-2018) regarding homosexual marriage and adoption.

The aim of this proposal is to share the results of a discourse analysis made to a Pentecostal group called UNEVAC (Unión Evangélica por los Valores Cristianos, Evangelical Union for Christian Values) known for taking distance from the "not representative" institutionalized main pentecostal churches and that has been characterized by its radical public manifestations against gay marriage and abortion projects. They maintain that Chile is currently a "homosexual dictatorship" and call Christians to civil disobedience against it.

### **10.4 Velma and Bernice: A Canadian Case Study of a Pentecostal Leadership Couple**

Linda M. Ambrose, Ph.D., Laurentian University, Sudbury, ON, Canada

[lambrose@laurentian.ca](mailto:lambrose@laurentian.ca)

Dilemmas about Pentecostal leadership couples usually centre on binary questions of gender relations and rhetoric about complementarian versus egalitarian views. But what if both members of a leadership couple are women? Pentecostal women's history commonly features the call narrative trope about becoming a leader as an (ironic) act of submission to God. Velma Chapman and Bernice Gerard, Pentecostal Assemblies of Canada ministers from Vancouver whose ministry spanned fifty years beginning in the 1940s, had a long and complex partnership. Gerard dedicated her autobiography saying, "With thanks to God "for Velma Chapman and the gift of her friendship and

partnership in ministry.” Before, during, and after Velma’s marriage, the two women enjoyed a special relationship that defied existing gender constructs. In North American Pentecostalism, heterosexual couples are normative, patriarchal organizational structures are dominant, and homosocial relationships are problematic. For all those reasons, the longstanding ministry partnership and intimate friendship of Chapman and Gerard is a fascinating case study to explore questions of gender and authority. In the hyper-masculinized and homophobic subcultures of North American Pentecostalism, is there any future for same-sex leadership couples like Velma and Bernice?

---

**Panel 11      Pentecostalism and Megachurches**

Time            11.30-13.00 hr.  
Location       1B-10  
Chair            Jan-Åke Alvarsson

**11.1      Pentecostal Megachurches in the Philippines**

Joel A. Tejejo, DMin, Asia Pacific Theological Seminary Baguio City, Philippines  
Email: [Joel\\_doulos@yahoo.com](mailto:Joel_doulos@yahoo.com)

There are many misconceptions over Pentecostal megachurches in the Philippines. They are often perceived as advocates of the prosperity theology and thus motivated by financial gain while their charismatic leaders are viewed by the popular media as individuals with a messiah complex because of the strong leadership demonstrate over their congregations and prominent role they play in the society. This chapter explores the growth of Pentecostal megachurches in the Philippines and their innovative indigenisation of the Christian faith as well as the influence of their Western counterparts. It begins with a review of the contemporary scholarship which has informed in the field and proceeds to identify the major Pentecostal megachurches which have been at the forefront of reinventing Christian witness in the Philippine society. It will offer two case studies of Pentecostal megachurches to examine their historical development, links to the poor and the middle class, networks, locations in the political landscape, doctrine of prosperity, and the form of their social and civic engagement. In doing so, this chapter seeks to answer the following questions: How have Pentecostal megachurches developed and what attracts the masses to attend them? What form of civic engagement do they play in indigenising gospel messages in the Philippine society?

Key Words: Pentecostalism, Charismatics, Mega-Churches, Philippines

**11.2      “The Best is Yet to Come”: The Role of Higher Education in the Future of Hillsong Church**

Denise A. Austin PhD, Alphacrucis College  
Email: [denise.austin@ac.edu.au](mailto:denise.austin@ac.edu.au)

“The best is yet to come” may be etched into Frank Sinatra’s tombstone but it has also become the believable mantra of Hillsong Church, which boasts 100,000 adherents worldwide at weekly services and a listening audience of 100 million people. The church has often faced media and academic criticism for its focus on financial and numerical growth. However, little research has been conducted into the educational activities of the church. In addition to vocational education, Hillsong also partners with Alphacrucis College, the national training college of Australian Christian Churches (formerly Assemblies of God in Australia) to deliver higher education degrees. Through oral interviews, clinical observation and analysis of primary and secondary literature, this paper argues that Hillsong Church’s strategic contributions toward higher education may ensure a sustainable

future through: propagating transformational leadership; rebranding Pentecostal theology; utilizing blended delivery; encouraging critical thinking; publicizing gender dialogue; and increasing awareness of social responsibility.

### **11.3 Personal and Pentecostal Identity in a Global Church: Two Glocal Pentecostal Examples from Norway**

Stian Sørli Eriksen VID (Specialized University, Center for Mission and Global Studies) *Silje Sævereid Kleiveland* Stavanger, Norway.

Email: [stian.eriksen@vid.no](mailto:stian.eriksen@vid.no)

This paper addresses the notions of personal and Pentecostal identity in light of two glocal church network examples from Norway, the Redeemed Christian Church of God (RCCG) in Norway and Hillsong Norway, which both have congregations in several of the larger cities in Norway. In contrast to RCCG, Hillsong Norway quite recently formally established through incorporation of an already existing comparable locally grown church network. Based on qualitative studies of and fieldwork in both churches, the paper discusses how individuals and congregations come to see themselves as part of a global church and how this relates to individual and congregational identity. Using especially transnational social theory and globalization perspectives, the paper addresses how taking part in global networks like these affect the sense of belonging, identities as well as social and community values in the congregations.

### **11.4 Politics of compassion: Hillsong in Amsterdam and NYC**

Miranda Klaver

Email: [m.klaver@vu.nl](mailto:m.klaver@vu.nl)

According to the vision of global pastor Brian Houston, Hillsong churches play in key role in impacting “cities of influence”. Key question for this paper is: how do churches like Hillsong relate to the city and in what ways are they socially engaged in the local urban context through their practices? In this paper, based on empirical research in Hillsong Amsterdam and Hillsong NYC, I will discuss the various ways Hillsong engages with the marginalized and poor in the city and beyond. I will address Hillsong’s theology of compassion and the various audiences Hillsong attracts which shapes Hillsong’s modes of social engagement in global city contexts.

---

#### **Panel 12 Book Session: Authors meet Critics**

Time 11.30-13.00 hr.  
Location 1B-06  
chair TBA

#### **“Transmitting the Spirit: Religious Conversion, Media and Urban Violence in Brazil” and “Violent Conversion: Brazilian Pentecostalism and Urban Women in Mozambique”**

Authors: Martijn Oosterbaan PhD and Linda van de Kamp PhD

Email: [M.Oosterbaan@uu.nl](mailto:M.Oosterbaan@uu.nl)

Email: [L.J.vandeKamp@uva.nl](mailto:L.J.vandeKamp@uva.nl)

Respondents: Jon Bialecki and Damaris Parsitau

Violence and Conversion are the themes that connect our books and raise some important questions about two related aspects of religion and urban risk in Rio de Janeiro and Maputo. Regarding favela life, on the one hand Pentecostal talk and media respond to the possible dangers of becoming involved in criminalized actions of drug trading gangs and victim of police violence, at the other hand magnify and reproduce the perceived risks of favela life. The very same process that teaches new converts to see their environment as the earthly battleground between God and the Devil and offers them practices to safely navigate in that arena, also produces suspicion vis-à-vis unconverted neighbors and an array of popular cultural practices that substantiates collective social life in the favelas. In Maputo, upwardly mobile women frequented Pentecostal churches because the Brazilian pastors preach and teach about how to make love, how to find and seduce the right partner and what a good marriage is about. It was very remarkable that women took many risks to be able to invest in new forms of relating and marrying: by offering almost all their savings to the churches and by breaking with the dominant ways of arranging marriages in their families. The powerful Pentecostal discourse of self-determination and cultural autonomy was an important driver for opening up new life spaces for upcoming middle class women in Maputo.